

RT Troubles Lessons Learned & Open Questions

Grațian Crișan

RT-Summit 2017

gratian.crisan@ni.com, gratian@gmail.com



Context

- National Instruments
 - Makes hardware & software for test, measurement and control
- Real-Time OS group
 - Using PREEMPT_RT for 6+ years
 - ARM and Intel x86_64 architectures
 - Embedded CPU + FPGA products
 - OpenEmbedded / Yocto based distribution
- Disclaimers
 - Work by multiple people
 - Intentionally picked problems with ugly hacks
 - Some data might be stale by now





Agenda

- problem_space();
- do {
 - rt_trouble_area();
 - discussion();
- While (topics && time);



^[1] our current use cases

^[2] in general wake-up latency accounts for majority of control loop latency



RT Trouble #1 How bumping an Ethernet cable can ruin your day RT and some TPM troubles



Symptoms

- CPU appears stalled in a MMIO read instruction for hundreds of µS
- Timer interrupts get delivered late even though the interrupts are enabled
- Initially discovered in e1000 / e1000e network drivers^[1]
 - by (accidentally) bumping into an Ethernet cable during a cyclictest run
- Recently found in TPM driver^[2]
 - by (intentionally) accessing the TPM chip while running cyclictest

^[1] drivers/net/ethernet/intel/e1000e/* ^[2] drivers/char/tpm/tpm_tis.c



Pointer: 37702.514296 Cursor: 37702.517099 Marker 37702.516354 Marker 37702.517099 A,B Delta: 0.000745



Page 1	* *	Search: Colum	in: #	‡ cor	ntains	‡ 🖉 gra	aph follows
#	CPU	Time Stamp	Task	PID	Latency	Event	Info
6081	1	37702.516307	nitpm	25644	10	sys_exit_open	0x5
6082	1	37702.516312	nitpm	25644	d0	page_fault_user	address=rt6_uncached_list ip=rt6_uncached_list error_code=0x6
6083	1	37702.516315	nitpm	25644	0	mm_page_alloc	page=0xffffea000015102d pfn=1380397 order=0 migratetype=1 gfp_flags=GFP_HIGHUSER_MOVABLE GFP_ZERO
6084	1	37702.516352	nitpm	25644	0	sys_enter	NR 1 (5, 244d1a8, 3f, 86f, 244d19c, 1000)
6085	1	37702.516354	nitpm	25644	10	sys_enter_write	fd: 0x00000005, buf: 0x0244d1a8, count: 0x0000003f
							vector=239
6087	1	37702.517109	nitpm	25644	d.h10	hrtimer_cancel	hrtimer=0xffffc9000600fe58
6088	1	37702.517113	nitpm	25644	d.h.0	hrtimer_expire_entry	hrtimer=0xffffc9000600fe58 now=23647271504381 function=hrtimer_wakeup/0x0
6089	1	37702.517116	nitpm	25644	d.h10	sched_waking	comm=cyclictest pid=25627 prio=1 target_cpu=001
6090	1	37702.517125	nitpm	25644	dNh20	sched_wakeup	cyclictest:25627 [1] success=1 CPU:001
6091	1	37702.517126	nitpm	25644	dNh.0	hrtimer_expire_exit	hrtimer=0xfffc9000600fe58
6092	1	37702.517127	nitpm	25644	dNh.0	write_msr	6e0, value 224a4d617da3
6093	1	37702.517128	nitpm	25644	dNh.0	local_timer_exit	vector=239
6094	1	37702.517130	nitpm	25644	dN.10	rcu_utilization	Start context switch
6095	1	37702.517131	nitpm	25644	dN.10	rcu_utilization	End context switch
6096	1	37702.517134	nitpm	25644	dN.20	sched_stat_runtime	comm=nitpm pid=25644 runtime=1310302 [ns] vruntime=949236367768 [ns]
6097	1	37702.517139	nitpm	25644	d20	sched_switch	nitpm:25644 [120] R ⇒ cyclictest:25627 [1]
6098	1	37702.517140	nitpm	25644	d20	tlb_flush	pages=-1 reason=flush on task switch (0)
6099	1	37702.517142	nitpm	25644	d20	x86_fpu_regs_deactivated	x86/fpu: 0xffff88017906a280 fpregs_active: 0 fpstate_active: 1 counter: 2 xfeatures: 1b xcomp_bv: 8000000000000b
6100	1	37702.517143	nitpm	25644	d20	x86_fpu_regs_activated	x86/fpu: 0xffff88016dfa2f00 fpregs_active: 1 fpstate_active: 1 counter: 7 xfeatures: 1b xcomp_bv: 8000000000000b
6101	1	37702.517144	nitpm	25644	d20	x86_fpu_regs_activated	x86/fpu: 0xffff88016dfa2f00 fpregs_active: 1 fpstate_active: 1 counter: 7 xfeatures: 1b xcomp_bv: 8000000000000b
6102	1	37702.517144	nitpm	25644	d20	write_msr	c0000100, value 7fd681efa700
6103	1	37702.517147	cyclictest	25627	0	sys_exit	NR 230 = 0
6104	1	37702.517148	cyclictest	25627	10	sys_exit_clock_nanosleep	0×0
6105	1	37702.517169	cyclictest	25627	0	sys_enter	NR 1 (5, 7fd681efa300, 21, 0, 0, 21)
6106	1	37702.517170	cyclictest	25627	10	sys_enter_write	fd: 0x00000005, buf: 0x7fd681efa300, count: 0x00000021
6107	1	37702.517176	cyclictest	25627	1	print	tracing_mark_write: hit latency threshold (352 > 100)
6108	1	37702.517178	cyclictest	25627	0	sys exit	NR 1 = 33

1 4

Cyclictest histogram with TPM load





Cyclictest histogram with TPM load





Why this happens

- CPU can write exponentially faster than the I/O device can sink
- Writes are buffered between the CPU and I/O
- Generally not an issue if the number of writes is small
- A MMIO read has to wait for every write to drain resulting in hundreds of µS latency spikes





















e1000/e1000e hack^[1]

ele flush();

+#ifdef CONFIG_E1000_DELAY
+#define E1000_WR_DELAY() usleep_range(50, 100)
+#else ...

^[1] <u>https://www.spinics.net/lists/linux-rt-users/msg14077.html</u>



tpm_tis patch^[1]

```
--- a/drivers/char/tpm/tpm tis.c
+++ b/drivers/char/tpm/tpm tis.c
<u>@@ -103,7 +128,7 @@ static int tpm tcg write bytes(struct tpm tis data</u>
*data
    struct tpm tis tcg phy *phy = to tpm tis tcg phy(data);
    while (len--)
        iowrite8(*value++, phy->iobase + addr);
        tpm tis iowrite8(*value++, phy->iobase, addr);
    return 0;
+static inline void tpm tis iowrite8(u8 b, void iomem *iobase,...)
+{
    iowrite8(b, iobase + addr);
+
                                        #ifdef CONFIG PREEMPT RT FULL
    tpm tis flush(iobase);
                                         ioread8(iobase + TPM ACCESS(0));
```

^[1] <u>https://lkml.org/lkml/2017/8/15/663</u>



- Preface: we know this is a hardware problem that might not have a good software solution.
- Is it possible / likely on other archs?
- Other drivers you know of that have this problem?



- Can we detect this access pattern (at runtime)?
- Any way to track I/O buffer states?



- Other ways to throttle MMIO stores?
- Is there a more general solution possible?
 - Adding a load (with exceptions) in iowriteN()/writeX() macros for PREEMPT_RT?^[1]

^[1] <u>https://lkml.org/lkml/2017/8/7/550</u>



RT Trouble #2 Concurrent hrtimer expirations from low priority threads



RT Trouble #2 – Thank You! Concurrent hrtimer expirations from low priority threads



Symptoms

- Multiple timed sleeps or timeouts coming from SCHED_OTHER threads can stack up to large latencies for RT threads
- It is not just clock_nanosleep()
 - lots of other things that use hrtimers e.g. futexes (with timeouts)





Pathological test

Configurable number of SCHED_OTHER threads doing

```
while (!g_stop) {
    t.tv_sec = 0;
    interval = (rand() * 1000000LL) / RAND_MAX;
    t.tv_nsec = interval;
    clock_nanosleep(CLOCK_MONOTONIC, 0, &t, NULL);
}
```



	kernelshark(trace.dat)							
File F	le Filter Plots Capture Help					24272 000050 Marilia	2-core ARMv7@667MHz wi	th event tracing
Pointer	: 42427	72.004124 Cursor	: 424272.0	006043 Ma	arker <mark>A:</mark> 4	24272.006059 Marker	424272.006249 A,B Delta: 0.000190	
							190µS	
							424272.004907	424272.006384
CDU A								
CFUU								
CDU 1								
CPUI								
cyclic	oct 779	0						
cyclic	.est-770							
Page 1	A 7	Search: Column	: #	‡ co	ontains	÷	✓ graph follows	
#	CPU .	Time Stamp	Task	PID L	Latency	Event	Info	
34607	0	424272 006043	ttoct	7939 6	d h20	ira handler entry	irn-90 nama-tud	
34608	0	424272.006043	ttest	7939 0	d h30	hrtimer cancel	I 1 4 2 Haller Wu	
34609	0	424272 006049	ttest	7939	d. h20	hrtimer expire entry	In class occupation	
34610	0	424272.006052	ttest	7939	d.h30	sched waking		
34611	0	424272.006058	ttest	7939 0	dNh40	sched wakeup	cyclictest:7789 [1] success=1 CPU:000	
34612	0	424272.006060	ttest	7939 0	dNh20	hrtimer expire exit	hrtimer=0xc7ae3ef0	
34613	0	424272.006062	ttest	7939 0	dNh30	hrtimer_cancel	hrtimer=0xc820bef0	
34614	0	424272.006065	ttest	7939 0	dNh20	hrtimer_expire_entry	hrtimer=0xc820bef0 now=424272002659534 function=hrtimer_wakeup/0x0	
34615	0	424272.006067	ttest	7939 d	dNh30	sched_waking	comm=ttest pid=8251 prio=120 target_cpu=000	
34616	0	424272.006073	ttest	7939 d	dNh40	sched_stat_runtime	comm=ttest pid=7939 runtime=42276 [ns] vruntime=1478082751184 [ns] \vdash \sim 15 US	
34617	0	424272.006080	ttest	7939 c	dNh40	sched_wakeup	ttest:8251 [120] success=1 CPU:000	
34618	0	424272.006082	ttest	7939 0	dNh20	hrtimer_expire_exit	hrtimer=0xc820bef0	
34619	0	424272.006084	ttest	7939 c	dNh30	hrtimer_cancel	hrtimer=0xc8a7bef0	
34620	0	424272.006086	ttest	7939 c	dNh20	hrtimer_expire_entry	hrtimer=0xc8a7bef0 now=424272002659534 function=hrtimer_wakeup/0x0	
34621	0	424272.006088	ttest	7939 c	dNh30	sched_waking	comm=ttest pid=7840 prio=120 target_cpu=000	
34622	0	424272.006093	ttest	7939 c	dNh40	sched_stat_runtime	comm=ttest pid=7939 runtime=20955 [ns] vruntime=1478082772139 [ns]	
34623	0	424272.006098	ttest	7939 c	dNh40	sched_wakeup	ttest:7840 [120] success=1 CPU:000	
34624	0	424272.006100	ttest	7939 0	dNn20	nrtimer_expire_exit		
34025	0	424272.006102	ttest	7939 0		hrumer_cancei		
24627	0	424272.006104	ttoct	7939 0		schod waking	In clinic-box/bosice now-442/2002003334 function-in trimer_wakeup/0x0	
34628	0	424272.000100	ttest	7939 0	dNh40	sched stat runtime	Commertesc pice-rass profiles zona contract contract and	
34629	0	424272.006115	ttest	7939	dNh40	sched wakeup		
34630	0	424272.006117	ttest	7939	dNh20	hrtimer expire exit		
34631	0	424272.006118	ttest	7939 0	dNh30	hrtimer cancel	hrtimer=0xc7b5fef0	
34632	0	424272.006121	ttest	7939 0	dNh20	hrtimer_expire_entry	hrtimer=0xc7b5fef0 now=424272002659534 function=hrtimer wakeup/0x0	
34633	0	424272.006123	ttest	7939 0	dNh30	sched_waking	comm=ttest pid=7794 prio=120 target cpu=000	
34634	0	424272.006127	ttest	7939 0	dNh40	sched_stat_runtime	comm=ttest pid=7939 runtime=16503 [ns] vruntime=1478082806333 [ns]	0
34635	0	424272.006132	ttest	7939 0	dNh40	sched_wakeup	ttest:7794 [120] success=1 CPU:000	
34636	0	424272.006134	ttest	7939 c	dNh20	hrtimer_expire_exit	hrtimer=0xc7b5fef0	U

45 8



- Intel^(R) Atom^(™) E3825 @ 1.33GHz dual core
- kernel: 4.11.12-rt14
- cyclictest -m -S -p 98 -i 237 –H 200
- three day run
- two devices:
- 1. hackbench -g25 -l 100000000
 - running in process mode with 25 groups using 40 file descriptors each (== 1000 tasks)
- 2. 1000 threads running timer stress

19:5



- 25
- ARMv7 (v7l) @ 667MHz dual core
- kernel: 4.11.12-rt14
- cyclictest -m -S -p 98 -i 737 –H 500
- three day run
- two devices:
- 1. hackbench -l 100000000 -f 25
 - running in process mode with 10 groups using 50 file descriptors each (== 500 tasks)
- 2. 500 threads running timer stress

Hack^[1] that (kind of) worked before v4.11.12-rt13

[1] https://marc.info/?l=linux-rt-users&m=148354667204563&w=2



Much better patch^[1]

time/hrtimer: Use softirq based wakeups for non-RT threads

Normal wake ups (like clock_nanosleep()) which are performed by normal users can easily lead to 2ms latency spikes if (enough) hrtimer wakeups are synchronized. This patch moves all hrtimers wakeups to the softirq queue unless the caller has a RT priority.

Reported-by: Gratian Crisan <gratian.crisan@ni.com> Signed-off-by: Sebastian Andrzej Siewior <bigeasy@linutronix.de>

[1] https://lkml.org/lkml/2017/10/4/560







Lessons learned

- Report problems early
- Upgrade to the latest linux-rt-devel branch as soon as possible
- Don't go on vacation before your RT-Summit presentation



RT Trouble #3 Lack of priority inheritance support in the glibc pthread library



libpthread priority inheritance support

- With priority inheritance support:
 - pthread_mutex_*

```
FUTEX_LOCK_PI/UNLOCK_PI
```

- Without priority inheritance support:
 - pthread_rwlock_* internal lock
 - sem_*
 - pthread_spin_*
 - pthread_cond_* internal lock

FUTEX_WAIT/WAKE FUTEX_WAIT_BITSET/WAKE user-space spinning see next slide



pthread conditional variables



Status: NEW

Alias: None

Reported: 2010-05-11 18:45 UTC by Darren Hart Modified: 2017-08-31 20:44 UTC (History) CC List: 16 users (show)

Product: glibc Component: nptl (show other bugs) Version: 2.12

Importance: P2 enhancement

Target Milestone: ---

Assignee: Not yet assigned to anyone

URL: Keywords:

Depends on: Blocks: <u>See Also:</u> <u>Host:</u> <u>Target:</u> <u>Build:</u> Last reconfirmed:

Flags: fweimer: security-



Current state glibc bug #11588

Torvald Riegel 2017-01-11 11:50:41 UTC

Comment 56

The new condition variable implementation is now committed upstream. It should be the base for any improvement suggestions from now on.

How to support PI for condvars has also been discussed at the Linux Real-Time Summit 2016: <u>https://wiki.linuxfoundation.org/realtime/events/rt-summit2016</u> /schedule

So far, there is no known solution for how to achieve PI support given the current constraints we have (eg, available futex operations, POSIX requirements, ...).



Austin Group defect #609

ID	Category	Severity	Туре	Date Submitted	Last Update		
0000609	[1003.1(2004)/Issue 6] System Interfaces	Editorial	Clarification Requested	2012-09-20 14:18	2016-05-17 22:13		
Reporter	mmihaylov	View Status	public				
Assigned To	ajosey						
Priority	normal	Resolution	Open				
Status	Under Review						
Name	Mihail Mihaylov						
Organization							
User Reference							
Section	pthread_cond_broadcast, pthread_cond_signal						
Page Number	1043						
Line Number	33043 - 33046						
Interp Status							
Final Accepted Text							
Summary	0000609: It is not clear what threads are considered blocked with respect to a call to pthread_cond_signal() or pthread_cond_broadcast()						



- Do you know of work underway / progress since last year?
- Alternative libraries out there for RT friendly locking?
- Any RT friendly data structures library (e.g. circular buffers, FIFOs, etc.)



RT Trouble #4 Managing IRQ priorities and IRQ priority inversions



Big disclaimers

- We know the following patches are not appropriate for upstream
- The need for them arises from our inexperience at the time and a usability problem with mapping an IRQ to its corresponding thread PID
- We are looking for best practice ideas



What is the best way to set IRQ priorities?

Currently carrying^[1]:

irq: Add priority support to /proc/irq/../

This patch allows configuring priority for different irq threads through the /proc/irq/ system (much same as the existing mechanism to configure the core affinity for irqs).

Signed-off-by: Sankara S Muthukrishnan <sankara.m@ni.com>
Signed-off-by: Julia Cartwright <julia.cartwright@ni.com>

^[1] <u>https://github.com/ni/linux/commit/5ff3a76173659863b6c5bda9ecf094d4621ccba7</u>



What is the best way to set priorities on new IRQs?

Currently carrying^{[1][2]}:

[RFC][PATCH] fs/proc: add poll()ing support to /proc/interrupts

Implement polling on procfs' "interrupts" file which observes changes to IRQ action handlers. The poll fires each time an action handler is registered or unregistered.

This change enables daemons to watch for changes and apply certain system policies relating to IRQ processing. For example, modify execution priority of dedicated IRQ tasks after they're created.

Signed-off-by: Haris Okanovic <haris.okanovic@ni.com>
Signed-off-by: Ovidiu-Adrian Vancea <ovidiu.vancea@ni.com>
Signed-off-by: Brad Mouring <brad.mouring@ni.com>

^[1] <u>https://github.com/ni/linux/commit/8e2f148e2f4762cc2b6490ec01d5d31bc440bcf8</u>

^[2] <u>http://www.spinics.net/lists/linux-rt-users/msg14076.html</u>



IRQ priority inversions

<u>Example</u>

- Context
 - Watchdog functionality implemented in a CPLD connected to a I²C bus
 - It can be configured to fire an interrupt (as opposed to a straight reset)
- Behavior
 - High priority watchdog interrupt fires
 - To acknowledge the interrupt slow I²C transfers need to happen
 - I²C interrupt thread has low priority
 - Some unrelated mid-priority thread preempts the I²C interrupt





- Ongoing work on avoiding IRQ priority inversions?
- Is there a more general solution to the priority inversion problem with completion objects?





Extra stuff



Tip #1 Check config options after a kernel upgrade



config CPU_SW_DOMAIN_PAN^[1] bool "Enable use of CPU domains to implement privileged no-access" depends on MMU && !ARM_LPAE default y

help

Increase kernel security by ensuring that normal kernel accesses are unable to access userspace addresses. This can help prevent use-after-free bugs becoming an exploitable privilege escalation by ensuring that magic values (such as LIST_POISON) will always fault when dereferenced.

^[1] Introduced in v4.3, commit a5e090acbf54 ("ARM: software-based priviledged-no-access support"). Adds code in uaccess_*, save_regs, load_regs macros.





☆ ← → [+ Q ≟ 🗹 🖺

pan/zoom

Perf Diff

#

#

Event 'cy	cles:ppp'		
Baseline	Delta	Shared Object	Symbol
20.83%	-7.06%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k]getnstimeofday64
17.34%	-1.25%	libc-2.23.so	<pre>[.]clock_gettime</pre>
15.93%	+3.05%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] vector swi
8.88%	+10.38%	[kernel.kallsyms]	<pre>[k] sys_clock_gettime</pre>
6.63%	-2.07%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k]copy_to_user_std
5.59%		[kernel.kallsyms]	<pre>[k] gt_counter_read</pre>
4.86%	-1.24%	[kernel.kallsyms]	<pre>[k] ret_fast_syscall</pre>
3.82%	-0.36%	simple_clock_gettime	[.] main
3.54%	+1.15%	[kernel.kallsyms]	<pre>[k] gt_clocksource_read</pre>
3.29%	-0.12%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] getnstimeofday64
2.99%	+0.19%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] posix clock realtime get
2.94%	+0.44%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] clockid to kclock
2.06%		[kernel.kallsyms]	[k]aeabi_llsr
0.70%	-0.32%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] local restart
0.55%	-0.54%	simple clock gettime	[.] memset@plt
0.01%		ld-2.23.so	[.] do lookup x
0.01%		[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] vma interval tree remove
0.01%	-0.00%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] v7 flush icache all
0.01%		[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] test and set bit
0.01%		[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] strnlen user
0.00%		[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] alloc pages nodemask
0.00%	-0.00%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] perf event exec
	+2.99%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] gt counter read
	+1.53%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] aeabi lasr
	+0.68%	simple clock gettime	[.] gmon start @plt
	+0.20%	simple clock gettime	[.] sched setaffinity@plt
	+0.01%	[kernel.kallsyms]	<pre>[k] cpuset node allowed</pre>
	+0.01%	ld-2.23.so	[.] dl init paths
	+0.01%	ld-2.23.so	[.] dl lookup symbol x
	+0.01%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] filemap map pages
	+0.01%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] do page fault
	+0.00%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] pfn valid
	+0.00%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] rt mutex lock
	+0.00%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] finish task switch
	+0.00%	[kernel.kallsyms]	[k] raw spin unlock irg



Tip #2 Check your clock sources



Check your clock sources

- Issues encountered
 - TSC clock source gets disabled by the clock source watchdog due to acpi_pm rollover
 - Boot hang caused by left over test code in BIOS that sets the TSC_ADJUST register on core 0
- On upgrades and new hardware it helps to:
 - Check current clock source

/sys/devices/system/clocksource/clocksource0/current_clocksource

- Compare timer expirations against external reference
- Drive trace off external clock source (e.g. FPGA)



Tip #3 Run reboot tests



Run reboot tests

- Multiple issues discovered by running a simple reboot test
 - Hangs on boot
 - Ext4 data corruptions
 - NAND read disturbs
 - Ethernet link detection issues
 - futex race on exit
 - i915 crash on module load
- Suggestions
 - Simple test calls reboot once the software stack is up
 - Hard reboots data loss is OK, data corruption is not
 - (optional) Temperature controlled chamber



